

2016 Reporting to the University Senate

Committee on Academic Tenure
Promotion and Reappointment (CATPR)

Paul Bergstrom – 2016 Chair

19 October 2016



**Michigan
Technological**
University

Scope of Reporting

Following the reporting scope from the Faculty Handbook, Appendix I:

- 8.2. Disclosure of Decisions Concerning Appeals
 - Each year, upon completion of consideration of all appeals, the Committee on Academic Tenure, Promotion, and Reappointment shall report to the academic faculty:
 - i. the number of tenure, promotion, or reappointment appeals received by the Committee;
 - ii. the number of tenure, promotion, or reappointment appeals in which the Committee recommended a new review.
- 8.3. Disclosure of Route of Appeal
 - Each year the Committee on Academic Tenure, Promotion, and Reappointment shall report to the academic faculty:
 - i. the membership of the committee;
 - ii. the mechanism for submitting appeals.
 - This information is to be reported to the academic faculty no later than March 1 of the subsequent academic year.



CATPR Reporting - Appeals

- 8.2 Disclosure of Decisions Concerning Appeals
 - i. TPR appeals received
 - 2014-2015 AY – 1 promotion appeal received
 - 2015-2016 AY – 1 tenure appeal received
 - ii. TPR appeals with new review – None



CATPR Reporting - Membership

- 8.3 Disclosure of Route of Appeal
 - i. CATPR Membership
 - 2014-2015 committee
 - Audrey Mayer (Chair), Paul Bergstrom, Sonia Goltz, Haiying Liu, James Wood
 - 2015-2016 committee
 - Paul Bergstrom (Chair), Sonia Goltz, Anne Beffel, Haiying Liu, James Wood



CATPR Reporting – Appeal Mechanism

8.3 Disclosure of Route of Appeal - ii. the appeal procedure
Per Appendix I, section 7.

- 7. Appeals
 - Candidates who are not reappointed, or who are denied tenure or promotion, may appeal, in writing, to the Committee on Academic Tenure, Promotion, and Reappointment. All appeals must be filed with the Committee within 30 calendar days following the date of notification by the Provost of a negative recommendation to the President. No other route of appeal is provided. Appeals must specifically list the basis for the appeal including the aspect of the policy or procedure that the candidate believes was violated. All such written appeals must be delivered to the Office of the Provost who will forward them to the committee.
- 7.1. Basis for Appeals
 - The only grounds for appeals of negative recommendation for reappointment, tenure or promotion are the failure of a recommending party or parties to follow the Tenure and Promotion Policy, the Faculty Staffing Policy and/or the Tenure, Promotion, and Reappointment Procedures.



Scope of proposed revisions to Appendix I based on CATPR cases

- 2015 and 2016 cases have resulted in recommendations regarding:
 - Administrative procedures in PTR cases
 - Changes proposed to Appendix I to clarify opaque descriptions of procedure
- Provost will formally submit proposal to modify Appendix I to the University Senate Academic Policy Committee based on CATPR recommendations



CATPR Appendix I recommendations

- To avoid any doubt regarding the University's standards for national recognition ("progress towards" for Associates, "achieved" for Fulls), these exact phrases should be incorporated into Appendix I of the Faculty Handbook.
- The word "normally" is used in Appendix I regarding the inclusion of all external letters in a binder. We recommend that the administration request a discussion in the University Senate regarding whether to keep this word in, as the flexibility it allows also allows for the perception that letters may be discarded for some candidates due to malice or bias.
- The University's requirement for "a minimum of 3 external letters" only appears in the Binder Checklist document. We recommend adding this requirement to Appendix I of the Faculty Handbook. Additionally, it is the opinion of the CATPR that 3 letters is insufficient and this may be a topic for the Senate to discuss.



Appendix I recommendations (cont'd)

- The CATPR recognizes *pending materials* as submitted and under review by an external organization, and those materials having been documented in the Form F at the time of submission of the tenure and promotion package. We recommend that the university expand the definition of pending materials to include not only pending publications and pending funding, but also pending creative works.
- The procedures outlined in the Faculty Handbook Appendix I Section 5.3 are vague in describing how new information concerning pending materials should be incorporated into the package, and vague in describing whether the new information about pending materials should require a re-evaluation at the department TPR committee level. The CATPR therefore recommends clear specifications of the conditions under which a tenure or promotion package is re-evaluated at the department TPR committee level. We also recommend that the re-evaluation of tenure and promotion packages at the department, college, or interschool level following receipt of new information on pending materials should *not* occur after the package is vetted by HR. The Provost may accept and consider new information after other materials have been vetted by HR.



Appendix I recommendations (cont'd)

- Appendix I of the Faculty Handbook under section 1 and section 6 does not specify academic rank when discussing academic unit PTR committee membership, beyond specifying a tenured rank. Review of the written recommendations from prior CATPR appeal cases indicates a recommendation that progress toward the Professor rank be evaluated by faculty from within or external to the unit at the Professor rank.
- The CATPR also recommends that the membership of the CATPR committee be composed of faculty at the Professor rank. Current requirements only call for academic tenure with some exceptions, as defined in Appendix I, section 7.2.1.



CATPR University Elections

- Reminder that the University Senate must elect members to the CATPR for a term that starts in January 2017
- Current terms
 - Paul Bergstrom (President) ECE 12/31/2017
 - Sonia Goltz (President) SBE 12/31/2017
 - Haiying Liu (Senate) Chemistry 12/31/2016
 - Anne Beffel* (Senate) VPA 12/31/2016
 - James Wood (Senate) GMES 12/31/2016

*Anne Beffel replaced Audrey Mayer, on sabbatical 2016-2017



Questions?

- Paul Bergstrom
 - 7-2058
 - paulb@mtu.edu

